

## **Attachment C – Property Assessment**

This property assessment has been prepared by *Keylan Consulting Pty Ltd* (Keylan) on behalf of JCDecaux to accompany and respond to the Department of Planning and Environments (DPE) request for additional information for the installation of a digital advertising sign on the northern side of City West Link Road, Lilyfield (DA/22/9255).

The following residential properties have been identified for this assessment based on their proximity to the proposal and submissions received during the exhibition period:

- 92-94 Brenan Street & 24 Pretoria Street, Lilyfield
- 72 Brenan Street, Lilyfield
- 24 Russell Street, Lilyfield
- 62-70 Brenan Street, Lilyfield
- 107 Lilyfield Road, Lilyfield
- 24 & 27 Trevor Street, Lilyfield

The assessment finds the impacts on the amenity of the residential receivers at the abovementioned properties are minimal and/or acceptable and are an improved outcome to the previous location proposed in the original application.

### ***92-94 Brenan Street, Lilyfield***

92-94 Brenan Street is a semi-detached residential terrace located approximately 30m west of the site as shown in Figure 1 below.

Amenity impacts on these residences, as a result of the proposed sign, are considered minimal for the following reasons:

- Both dwellings are orientated to the north and the sign will be located to the north-east. Therefore, these dwellings will not have direct view lines towards the sign. View lines are shown in an aerial overview at Figure 3. Potential view lines would be largely limited to the side of the sign and not the advertising panels.
- Both dwellings have small windows on the northern elevations fronting City West Link Road. The eastern dwelling also has dense vegetation which restricts views out towards the City West Link Road and proposed sign. The western dwelling is subtly setback from the City West Link Road and views towards the sign will be limited due to the adjoining dwellings vegetation.
- The maximum luminance calculated at these properties is 0.2 lux. This illuminance level complies with the maximum AS4282 limit of 2 lux. In complying with this requirement, the proposed signage will not result in unacceptable glare or adversely impact the amenity of the residents.

### ***24 Pretoria Street, Lilyfield***

24 Pretoria Street is a detached residential dwelling located approximately 25m west of the site as shown in Figure 2 below. This dwelling is the closest residential receiver to the proposed sign. Notwithstanding, impacts on the residential receivers are considered acceptable for the following reasons:

- The dwelling is oriented towards Pretoria Street, being the primary frontage. Pretoria Street is a no-through road with a retaining wall and fencing, which provide visual and acoustic screening, and vegetation as outlined in the RFI letter.
- The dwelling has a tall fence on its northern elevation on the City West Link Road as shown in Figure 2. This fence restricts views from the property towards the road corridor and proposed sign. Any potential view lines would be largely limited to the side of the sign and not the advertising panels.
- The maximum luminance calculated at this property is 0.3 lux. This illuminance level complies with the maximum AS4282 limit of 2 lux. In complying with this requirement, the proposed signage should not result in unacceptable glare or adversely impact the amenity of the residents.



Figure 1: Property at 92-94 Brenan Street (Source: Google Maps)





Figure 2: Property at 24 Pretoria Street (Source: Google Maps)



Figure 3: Aerial image of the site and subject properties (Source: Nearmaps)



Figure 4: Indicative view towards the proposed sign from the footpath outside 24 Pretoria Street (Source: Keylan)

### **72 Brenan Street, Lilyfield**

72 Brenan Street (also referred to as 21 Pretoria Street) is located approximately 35m east of the site. The site contains a three-storey townhouse development and is shown in Figures 5 and 6 below. An annotated aerial image is also provided at Figure 7 to demonstrate the direction of the view lines from this property.

Importantly, the sign has been relocated since the original application and is now proposed 18m further west to respond to the concerns raised by DPE, Council and in the public submissions. On this basis, impacts have been reduced and the sign will result in improved and acceptable impacts for the following reasons:

- Direct views are not anticipated from the site as each dwelling is orientated to the north-east to capture views of the city. Therefore, it is unlikely that there will be views to the sign from internal areas within these dwellings. It is anticipated that views towards the sign will be limited to the north-east facing balconies when occupants purposefully look west and back towards the sign.
- No habitable rooms are located at street level as this section of the property consists of an aboveground car parking garage.
- The maximum luminance calculated at this property is 1.6 lux. This illuminance level complies with the maximum AS4282 limit of 2 lux. In complying with this requirement, the proposed signage should not result in unacceptable glare or adversely impact the amenity of the residents.





Figure 5: 72 Brenan Street (Source: Google Maps)



Figure 6: View towards indicative sign location from street level at 72 Brenan Street (Source: Keylan)



Figure 7: Aerial image of the site and subject property (Source: Nearmaps)

### ***24 Russell Street, Lilyfield***

24 Russell Street contains a residential dwelling. The site is located approximately 70m east of the site as shown in Figure 8 above. An annotated aerial image is provided at Figure 10 to demonstrate the direction of the view lines from this property and an indicative view towards the proposed sign location from the dwelling is provided at Figure 9.

Impacts on the residential amenity as a result of the proposed sign are considered minimal for the following reasons:

- Direct views are not anticipated from the dwelling as it is orientated towards the north-east and the sign will be located to the west.
- The dwelling has windows on its northern elevations fronting City West Link Road, however, these windows are relatively small and are orientated to the north-east. As the sign will be positioned to the west, views towards the structure would only occur if occupants were to purposefully look west and back towards the sign. Further these windows are associated with a kitchen and living room and not a bedroom.
- There is substantial, dense vegetation located on the nature strip directly in front of the dwelling, which will restrict direct view lines towards the sign.
- The maximum luminance calculated at this property is 0.8 lux. This illuminance level complies with the maximum AS4282 limit of 2 lux. In complying with this requirement, the proposed signage should not result in unacceptable glare or adversely impact the amenity of the residents.





Figure 8: 24 Russell Street (Source: Google Maps)



Figure 9: View to the west from public footpath in front of property displaying views towards sign are limited (Source: Keylan)





Figure 10: Aerial image of the site and subject property (Source: Nearmaps)

### **62-70 Brenan Street, Lilyfield**

62-70 Brenan Street contains detached residential dwellings. The site is located approximately 100m east of the proposed sign. The dwellings are shown in Figure 11. An indicative view towards the proposed sign location from 62-70 Brenan Street is provided at Figure 12 and an annotated aerial image is provided at Figure 13 to demonstrate the direction of the view lines from this property.

Impacts on the residential amenity as a result of the proposed sign is considered minimal for the following reasons:

- The sign is located a significant distance from the dwellings.
- Direct views are not anticipated from the dwellings as they are orientated towards the north-east and the sign will be located to the west.
- The properties have windows on their northern elevations fronting City West Link Road, however, as the sign will be positioned to the west, views towards the structure would only occur if occupants were to purposefully look west and back towards the sign.
- There is also dense vegetation located on the nature strip directly in front of the property as well as substantial vegetation at the end of the Russell Street (no-through road) as shown in Figure 12. This vegetation will also screen any potential views towards the sign.
- The maximum luminance calculated at this property is 0.3 lux. This illuminance level complies with the maximum AS4282 limit of 2 lux. In complying with this requirement, the proposed signage should not result in unacceptable glare or adversely impact the amenity of the residents.





Figure 11: 62-70 Brenan Street (Source: Google Maps)



Figure 12: View to the west from public footpath in front of property displaying views towards sign are limited (Source: Keylan)



Figure 13: Aerial image of the site and subject property (Source: Nearmaps)

### ***107 Lilyfield Road, Lilyfield***

107 Lilyfield Road contains a 3-storey residential flat building located approximately 140m northeast of the site, on the opposite side of the railway corridor. The building is shown at Figure 14, an annotated aerial image is provided at Figure 15 to demonstrate the direction of the view lines from this property and an indicative view of the proposed sign from the balcony of one of the apartments is shown at Figure 16.

The sign is expected to result in improved and acceptable impacts at this property for the following reasons:

- Direct views are not anticipated from the property as it is orientated towards the south-east and the sign will be located to the south-west. The photo used to create the photomontage at Figure 16 was provided within a public submission. It is important to note that this photo does not reflect the natural view line from the balcony and the room that the balcony adjoins. Instead, this room faces south-east (instead of south-west towards the sign). An annotated aerial image is provided at Figure 15 below to demonstrate the direction of the view lines from this property.
- The revised location provides a substantial distance between the sign and the subject property (approximately 140m) as the sign has been relocated 18m further west to respond to the concerns raised by DPE, Council and in the public submissions.
- The design of the sign has been amended and will now result in a splayed structure. The signage panels will now more angled towards the transport corridor. A Design Statement provided by the architect is provided at Attachment E.
- The maximum luminance calculated at this property is 0.0 lux. This illuminance level complies with the maximum AS4282 limit of 2 lux. In complying with this requirement, the proposed signage will not result in unacceptable glare or adversely impact the amenity of the residents.





Figure 14: 107 Lilyfield Road (Source: Keylan)



Figure 15: Aerial image of the site and subject property (Source: Nearmaps)





Figure 16: Indicative view of the proposed sign from 107 Lilyfield Road (Source: Submitter and JCDecaux)

### **24 & 27 Trevor Street, Lilyfield**

24 and 27 Trevor Street, Lilyfield are detached residential dwellings located approximately 100m north of the site. These dwellings are located on the corner of Trevor Street and Lilyfield Road. An annotated aerial image is provided at Figure 19 to demonstrate the direction of the view lines from these dwellings and an indicative view towards the proposed sign from Trevor Road is provided at Figure 20.

Impacts on the residential amenity as a result of the proposed sign are considered minimal for the following reasons:

- Both dwellings have primary frontages to Trevor Street.
- Each dwelling has a window on the Lilyfield Road elevation, however views from these windows are not expected to be significant due to the small size of each window, existing vegetation along Lilyfield Road and the significant distance between these windows and the proposed sign. The properties are shown at figures 17 and 18 below.
- The maximum luminance calculated at these properties is 0.0 lux. This illuminance level complies with the maximum AS4282 limit of 2 lux. In complying with this requirement, the proposed signage will not result in unacceptable glare or adversely impact the amenity of the residents.





Figure 17: 27 Trevor Street (Source: Google Maps)



Figure 18: 24 Trevor Street (Source: Google Maps)





Figure 19: Aerial image of the site and subject properties (Source: Nearmaps)



Figure 20: View towards the sign from Trevor Street (Source: Keylan)